IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE WESTERN DIVISION

ELAINE BLANCHARD, KEEDRAN FRANKLIN, PAUL GARNER and BRADLEY WATKINS,)))
Plaintiffs, and)))
ACLU OF TENNESSEE, Inc.)))
Intervening Plaintiff, v.))) No. 2:17-cv-02120-jpm-DKV
THE CITY OF MEMPHIS,)
Defendant.)))

CITY OF MEMPHIS'S SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO DISMISS

INTRODUCTION

The City of Memphis, in its Memorandum in Support of Motion to Dismiss (Doc. 22-1) and its Reply Brief (Doc. 35), identified public record documents supporting the proposition that the intervening plaintiff, ACLU of Tennessee, Inc., is a separate and distinct entity from the corporate entity which was the plaintiff in the *Kendrick* litigation - The West Tennessee Civil Liberties Union, Inc. (WTCLU). This Supplemental Memorandum attaches documents located at the University of Memphis Library, Special Collections Department, containing the papers of Michael Cody, Esq., one of the founding incorporators of WTCLU. The collection contains letters and other documents which provide further circumstantial evidence for the proposition

advanced by the City of Memphis on this subject. The purpose of this Supplemental Memorandum is to bring those documents to the attention of the Court.

The City also wishes to point out that on April 4, 2017, during a telephonic status conference with the Court, the attorneys for the plaintiffs advised the Court that an individual plaintiff in the *Kendrick* litigation, Mike Honey, had agreed to become involved as an intervening plaintiff in the present litigation. (*See* Minute Entry 31).

It has been more than eight weeks since that telephonic status conference. The deadline pursuant to the Scheduling Order for adding new parties has now passed. (*See* Scheduling Order Doc. 34). The standing issue must be resolved based on the identities of the parties before the Court.

Documents from the Cody papers maintained in the Special Collections Department:

Exhibit One is an Affidavit jointly executed by Pete Anthony Brunson and Samuel Collins Fulliton, summer associates with Baker, Donelson, Bearman, Caldwell & Berkowitz, outlining their inspection of and review of documents contained in the Special Collections Department at the University of Memphis Library regarding Mr. Cody's papers. The documents pulled from the collection have been authenticated by these witnesses and contain the following information, which is relevant to the Motion to Dismiss:

1. Letter to Mr. Cody from John W. Spence dated April 23, 1969. Attached as Exhibit Two. Mr. Spence describes himself as "a member of the Boards of the West Tennessee Chapter and the Tennessee affiliate," further confirming that the WTCLU is an entity separate and distinct from the ACLU of Tennessee, referenced as "the Tennessee affiliate." The correspondence further addresses concerns over efforts by the national ACLU to raise funds as interfering with dues collection for WTCLU. Clearly, as of that date, these two entities were

completely separate and distinct although there may well have been common board membership such as was apparently the case with Mr. Spence.

- 2. Exhibit Three is a 1969 letter to Mr. Cody from Delton Pickering which similarly demonstrates the distinction between these two entities. In the letter, Mr. Pickering describes himself as the President of "ACLU in West Tennessee" which indicates a possible corporate organizational structure affiliated with ACLU of Tennessee, Inc., as opposed to WTCLU.
- 3. A third document retrieved from the records is a "Notice of Proposed By-Laws Change" which is undated but which was found with other materials almost exclusively dating to 1969. Attached as Exhibit Four. The proposed By-Laws change indicates an intention to combine the membership of individuals who may be associated with WTCLU and ALCU of Tennessee, Inc. No further records concerning the final disposition of the "Notice" were located, and ACLU of Tennessee, Inc. has provided no documentation of the implementation of this proposed Notice. Furthermore, even if a merger of some kind was implemented, this simply would have connected the two entities at a membership level and does nothing to alter the separate and distinct corporate organizational structures.

Finally, Collective Exhibit Five consists of an affiliates list and financial statements, which were documents located in the Cody materials apparently created by the ACLU national organization. These records clearly list WTCLU as a separate entity, as of 1967.

3

¹ In the City's Reply Brief responding to ACLU of Tennessee's attachment of corporate documents to its Response to the City's Motion to Dismiss, we noted that the corporate charter of the organization, dated September 18, 1968, did not include a "merger" or formal affiliation with WTCLU, instead stating an intention to "...absorb at a future time, if agreed by the membership and/or Board of Directors of both corporations, to assume and continue the operations of the West Tennessee Civil Liberties, Inc., a Tennessee corporation." (Doc. 35, p.4)

The Joint Affidavit attached further confirms that after a complete review of the materials in the Cody papers, no document was located indicating in any way a merger of WTCLU with ACLU of Tennessee, Inc., or any expressed intention of that ACLU of Tennessee, Inc. be substituted for or stand in the shoes of WTCLU in any pending or contemplated litigation.

CONCLUSION

For the reasons set forth previously and in this Supplemental Memorandum, the City respectfully requests that the Court find that the ACLU of Tennessee, Inc. has not carried its burden of demonstrating entitlement to standing to pursue the relief sought in the Complaint, and that the Complaint, at least with respect to forms of relief based upon the *Kendrick* litigation, be dismissed with prejudice.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Buckner Wellford

Buckner Wellford (#TN 9687)
Thomas Parker (#TN 13908)
Jennie Vee Silk (#TN 35319)
BAKER, DONELSON, BEARMAN,
CALDWELL & BERKOWITZ, P.C.
165 Madison Avenue, Suite 2000

Memphis, Tennessee 38103 Telephone: 901.577.2152

Fax: 901.577.0786

Email: bwellford@bakerdonelson.com tparker@bakerdonelson.com jsilk@bakerdonelson.com

Attorneys for Defendant, The City of Memphis

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on June 6, 2017, the foregoing will be served by this Court's ECF system to:

Bruce S. Kramer Scott A. Kramer 6070 Poplar Avenue, 6th Floor Memphis, Tennessee 38119

Thomas H. Castelli ACLU Foundation of Tennessee P.O. Box 120160 Nashville, Tennessee 37212

s/Buckner Wellford	ŀ
--------------------	---

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE WESTERN DIVISION

Joint Affidavit of Pete Anthony Bru	nson and Samuel Collins Fulliton
	ý
Defendant.))
THE CITY OF MEMPHIS,)
V.) No. 2:17-cv-02120-jpm-DKV
Intervening Plaintiff,)))
ACLU OF TENNESSEE, Inc.)
and	,)
Plaintiffs,)
FRANKLIN, PAUL GARNER and BRADLEY WATKINS,)))
ELAINE BLANCHARD, KEEDRAN)

1. My name is Pete Brunson. I am an adult resident of Fayetteville, Arkansas. I am over the age of 21, and I am competent to testify in this matter.

COUNTY OF SHELBY

- 2. My name is Sam Fulliton. I am an adult resident of Nashville, Tennessee. I am over the age of 21, and I am competent to testify in this matter.
- 3. The facts in this affidavit are based on our personal knowledge and are true and correct to the best of our knowledge, information, and belief.

- 4. I, Pete Brunson, am a student at the University of Arkansas School of Law. I just completed my second year of law school.
- 5. I, Samuel Fulliton, am a student at the Vanderbilt School of Law. I just completed my second year of law school.
- 6. We are both working as Summer Associates at the law firm of Baker, Donelson, Bearman, Caldwell & Berkowitz in Memphis, Tennessee, for six weeks during the summer of 2017.
- 7. One of our assignments as Summer Associates was to go to the University of Memphis Library, Special Collections Department, and review the file containing the papers of Michael Cody, Esq., one of the founding incorporators of the West Tennessee Civil Liberties Union, Inc.
- 8. On May 17, 2017, we visited the University of Memphis Library Special Collections Department and reviewed the file containing the papers of Michael Cody, Esq.
- 9. We looked through a master table of contents of the file boxes to determine which file boxes contained documents relevant to the ACLU and WTCLU. We then reviewed all of those boxes.
- 10. We looked specifically for any document that might shed some light on the organizational structure of the ACLU of Tennessee, Inc. and the West Tennessee Civil Liberties Union, Inc.
- 11. We located several relevant documents. The first was a letter to Mr. Cody from John W. Spence dated April 23, 1969. In the letter, Mr. Spence describes himself as "a member of the Boards of the West Tennessee Chapter and the Tennessee affiliate." The letter further

addresses concerns over efforts by the national ACLU to raise funds as interfering with dues collection for WTCLU.

- 12. The next relevant document we found is a 1969 letter to Mr. Cody from Delton Pickering. In the letter, Mr. Pickering describes himself as the President of "ACLU in West Tennessee" which indicated a possible corporate organizational structure affiliated with ACLU of Tennessee, Inc., as opposed to WTCLU.
- 13. A third document we found in the file is a "Notice of Proposed By-Laws Change" which is undated but which was found with other materials almost exclusively dating to 1969. The proposed By-Laws change indicates an intention to combine the membership of individuals who may be associated with WTCLU and ALCU of Tennessee, Inc. We found no further records regarding the final disposition of the "Notice."
- 14. We also found a list of affiliates as well as financial statements of the national organization of the ACLU. These records clearly list WTCLU as a separate entity, as of 1967.
- 15. We made copies of each of the above-listed documents, and we brought the true copies back to Baker Donelson for further review.
- 16. We thoroughly reviewed every document in the file boxes pertaining to the ACLU or the WTCLU, and the above listed documents were the most relevant documents to the issue of the organizational structure of the ALCU of Tennessee and the West Tennessee Civil Liberties Union, Inc. during the 1960s and 1970s.

FURTHER AFFIANTS SAITH NOT.

Pete Anthony Brunson

Samuel Collins Fulliton

SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO before me on this the 26th day of May, 2017.

Notary Public

My Commission Expires:

1-6.18

ÛNL

4/23/69

Mr. W. J. Michael Cody Burch, Porter & Johnson 128 N. Court Memphis, Tn., 38103

Dear Mike:

I have your letter reporting on the April 19-20 meeting of the national ACLU board. Thank you for what I Ljudge to be a concise and objective recital of the national issues discussed.

As to the Tennessee problem: I have voiced similar thoughts—that volunteer organizations such as the Tennessee affiliate must rely heavily on their paid staff for membership recruitment, etc.—several times. Mine is a long experience with such groups; there's hardly a one I haven't been a member of—sometimes a founder, often an officer.

Today, as a paid staff man for a somewhat similar organization—the U. S. Commission on Civil Rights, which relies heavily on Citizens Advisory Committees—I think I have still more insight into the needs of such groups.

To get down to cases, a disservince may have been done Mrs. Enhis when she was employed by the Tennessee affiliate, because her primary interests, I believe, are in the practice of law and legislation; an association executive must be interested in membership, financial strength, communication, and leadership development.

An attendant problem is affiliate-national relations: Our dues collection is complicated by national ACLU mailings. I will propose

2.

local collection and accounting, and a petition to the national ACLU that it discontaction of members of the Tennessee affiliate.

We have said repeatedly that we get so many solicitations that well lose track of when our dues are paid andwhen they are not.

I will be glad to discuss this further with you or others any time.

Sincerely yours,

John W. Spence 1565 Vinton Memphis, Tn., 38104

P.S. I am, as you may know, a member of the boards of the West Tennessee chapter and the Tennessee affiliate.

A Committee of the Committee

West Tennessee American Civil Liberties Union

625 MIDLAND • MEMPHIS, TENNESSEE 38111

March 27, 1974

ίij

Mr. W. J. Michael Cody P.O. Box 3115
Memphis, Tenn. 38103

Dear Mike:

which simply means that you've received the five renewar sourceautous routinely sent out by the national membership office and that in April your name will be "purged" from the rolls - unless you renew prior to that time. Obviously, those of us in the We remain officially in our number. We were informed last week that your membership in ACLU has those of us in the West So I'm enclosing a renewal form for Tennessee chapter are anxious that been "suspended" you your

civil liberties in the community. lot to us. growth. chapter increased by 43% this past year. You will be interested in knowing (or better) Hopefully, rate this year. So don't leave us now. we can continue to recruit new members Your membership and your good counsel that membership in the West We need you if we are to be a force We're really pleased with this at the Tennessee mean for

fight this year and reverse counterpart. had a chance to You did 3 0 0 a good job. you on some the of Tennessee's Republican gains. tube I hope we can put up last Sunday, along a winning with your Republican Democratic

Yours sincerely,

Delton Pickering President

ACLU in West Tennessee

Enclosure

NOTICE OF

PROPOSED BY-LAWS CHANGE

It is proposed that the statement in the by-laws on membership be changed to include persons in West Tennessee, as well as East and Middle Tennessee.

PRESENT BY-LAW: ARTICLE IV on MEMBERSHIP

All members in good standing of the American Civil Liberties Union, Inc., resident within the State of Tennessee east of the Tennessee River as it flows northerly from Alabama to Kentucky, shall be deemed members of the ACLU of Tennessee, Inc.

CHANGE THE ABOVE TO READ:

All members in good standing of the American Civil Liberties Union, Inc., resident within the State of Tennessee, shall be deemed members of the ACLU of Tennessee, Inc.

INVITATION

This meeting will be the first statewide annual meeting held by the Tennessee ACLU. It will be an opportunity for people throughout the state to meet each other and to discuss civil liberties problems in their respective cities to find out what other people are doing about them.

We have deliberately limited the number of speakers so that individuals attending the meeting will have an opportunity to talk informally with each other. Informal conversations over lunch may be one of the most valuable parts of a meeting such as this.

We realize that for many people it is a long drive to Nashville, but we hope that as many persons as possible will make an effort to attend. We need to meet each other face to face at least once a year. Please feel free to bring any friends whom you think would be interested.

As an aid to the persons planning the meeting, it would be helpful if you would fill out and return the slip below to the ACLU office, 2126 Belcourt, Nashville, Tenn. 37212.

I	(will)	(will	not)	(may)	attend	the	annual	meeting	on	May	10.	
Nar	ne											
					ubijotasas .							
Ado	iress				es) direck		•					
				avese s	wile. Pen	Seres and						

American Civil Liberties Union 156 Fifth Avenue New York, New York 10010

34.00tober 20, 1967

velkarest Usrisas ক্রত্ত্ব প্রথম সংক্রাইটিটিড

ADELL ARRAGA

Jan dan material alia di tibu

Keschtiva Director

- vandoznak ovilecióra --

. Milenes, Georgia 10303

MINA protestrat succession

versely there's eligible dame at

111100 (312) ANASSIS (1110)

caequive Director

WALLESS (ESS) (solite

out Olympia Bullothy | Colored Colored Viller

2022 27 7000

Sel acces , W.E., sports exities Se

Berkeley, California 94708 home: (415) 524-0771

* Wilso Er Soyaderek - dostik Mistoria (.) 1196 Woollown Britished oblikeli (2.) (.)

LIST OF AFFILIATES

*Person to correspond with.

ALABAMA

CLU of Alabama

Direct Correspondence To:

C. H. Erskine Smith*

City National Bank Building - 14th Floor

luveosibilio u

Birmingham, Alabama 35203

ARIZONA

Arizona CLU

Executive Director

Ted Mote*

1718 West Thomas Road

Phoenix, Arizona 85016

(602) 252-6291

President

Chairman

Bruce Clayton

Post Office Box 3921

Van Dusen Kennedy

673 Oberlin Avenue

Phoenix, Arizona 85030 signos in Colle ?

CALIFORNIA

Tari waluf

TELEBOOK SOMETIN ACLU of Northern California

Executive Director

Ernest Besig*

503 Market Street

San Francisco, California 94105

office: (415) 433-2750

Staff Counsel: Marshall W. Krause

ACLU of Southern California

Executive Director

Dr. Eason Monroe*

323 West Fifth Street, Room 202

Los Angeles, California 90013

office: (213) MA6-5156

Staff Counsel: A.L. Wirin

ennoinis Havers - 56825 cm . clinear President Tona: Standard

George Slaff

And a service of the

1041 North Formosa

Los Angeles, California 90046

home: (213) 466-5191

Nov Colombo, Lietototos, vi**ntina**igai AAA

COLORADO (104) EL CESTATA (144) COLORADO (144) EL CESTATA DE LA CALLA (144) (144) (144) (144) (144) (144) (144) Colorado Branch, ACLU

Executive Director

Mrs. Dorothy E. Davidson*

1452 Pennsylvania Street

Denver, Colorado 80203

office: (303) TA5-2930

Chairman Seed Diver (Largest) 19837 Royce Forsyth

2205 South High Street

Denver, Colorado

Greater Philadelphia Branch, ACLU Executive Director Spencer Coxe* 260 South Fifteenth Street Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19102 office: (215) PE5-7103 home: (215) VI3-8476

President Prof. Monroe Beardsley Philadelphia 3, Pennsylvania The second second second

RHODE ISLAND

Rhode Island CLU Executive Secretary Mrs. Norman Robinson (Natalie)* 142 Eighth Street Providence, Rhode Island 02906 (401) 861-2971

Chairman Prof. William G. McLoughlin . 204 Bowen Street Providence, Rhode Island 02906 (401) 521-0076 · · · bsak brasion0-81 diminaly sellivertholisis.

TENNESSEE

East Tennessee CLU President Walter Bishop* 102 West Lake Forrest Drive Knoxville, Tennessee 37920 home: (615) 577-2830 office: (615) 546-1660 ex. 274 Middle Tennessee CLU President Whitworth Stokes, Jr.*

618 Stahlman Building Nashville, Tennessee 37201 office: (615) 244-2202 home: (615) 292-8903

West Tennessee CLU President W.J. Michael Cody, Raq. ** 30 804 128 North Court Avenue Memphis, Tennessee 38103 (901) 527-6385 Sectio, Weeklogion 98104 0813-ASV (808) 1301734

Logic Counsel: Michael Rosse. ..

1.11. Bio Logi Toliga, incoller

Texas CLU

Executive Secretary

Mrs. Enid Political Mrs. Enid Hallock 3007 North Lamar, Room 203 Austin, Texas 78705 (512) 454-5856

Chairman Joseph L. Tita, Esq. Americana Building Houston, Texas 77002

office: (713) CA7-7288 1 12 (1998) home: (713) MO8-9716 Indexi (1550) indexid

2212 Hillington Green

HATU Madison, Wisconsis 1282-8351 Utah Affiliate, ACLU (800) 10000 Interim President Dr. Richard G. Henson*

1151 Michigan Avenue Salt Lake City, Utah 84105 office: (801) 364-1022

adison, Wiscoula 19791 - 2841-788 (808) Feelige 9082-86% (808) Famou

EXITE I.	Account. 28,325.62 (22,739.15 95,841.68 341.595.89	\$ 60.50 \$40,497.08 190.22 \$16,320,58 26,824,42 56,824,42 55,00	07 3. 60.50 \$67,897.50 3 190.22 \$19,674.60 07 38,386.12 \$89,656.65 \$6,031.90 \$61,270.49	\$40,000.00 \$ 4,600.00	12,996.00 \$1,000.57	\$\frac{150.00}{\$21.596.00}\$\$\$\$11,000.57\$\$\$\$4,750.00\$
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERY BUTTON, INC. (NATIONAL ORGANIZATION LYOUNG OF AFFILIATES) SPECIAL FUNDS SUMMARY OF FINANCELY ACTUITES AND FUND BALANCES YEAR ENDED DECEMBER 11 1968	140.c. Turber Endorment H. 257.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11 8 275.63.5.11	27.0557.7	\$222,033.80 \$46.22,03 813,466.48 \$15,173.71 39,103.07 \$822,033.80 \$419.57,12 817,013.34 \$111,001.02 59,103.07	\$ 71,300.00 \$ 26,700.0 27,400.42 2.6,824.40 8 576,00 18,600.00 5.196,00	12,000.00 2,000.00 2,000.00 12,000.00 12,000.00 180.00 1,000.37 5,993.30 6,996.00 6,996.00 6,206.98 7,246.98	1,000,00 1,000,00 1,1
SPECIAL	Fund Balances - January 1, 1968 Additions to Funds: Bequests and memorial gifts Less Affillates share and expense of collection	Dividends and interest (Note D) Contributions by affiliates Grant from Vigilance Fund Grant from Turner Fund Total Additions to Fund	Total Funds Available Grants and Expenses:	General Find Crists Area Fund Roger Baldwin Foundation of AGLU, Inc., ghetto office projects Arizona GLU Georgia GLU	Kentucky CLU Louisiana CLU Marylana CLU Marylana Cau National Capital Area CLU Tennesse, CLU Virginia CLU Wisconsin CLU	nëes , 1968 (Note C)

The accompanying notes are an intestal part of this are